

scripts which are missing all other expansions. The problem with this line of thinking is that both expansions are also absent in many manuscripts which otherwise contain half or over half of the expansions. The expansion to C.26 q.5 c.4 is missing from Me (4/8), Na (5/8), Tu (4/8), and Vv (5/8) while the expansion to C.13 q.1 d.p.c.1 is missing from Be (7/8), Ck (4/7), Cv (6/8), Fb (5/8), Ga (5/8), Hk (6/8), In (5/8), Lp (5/8), Pn (4/8), Sa (5/8), and Tz (5/8). The absence of these expansions in more complete manuscripts suggests that they were not added before the other expansions.

Mixed-Recension Manuscripts in Previous Scholarship

Mixed-recension manuscripts, because of their first-recension preservations, have played a large role in *Decretum* scholarship of the last 150 years. Emil Friedberg came to believe that Ka (4/8) and Kb (4/8) possessed very old readings and so prioritized them as the leading manuscripts A and B in his edition⁸⁰. Jacqueline Rambaud-Buhot commented frequently on Gt (0/8), Py (1/8), Pf (2/8), Pn (4/8), and Pa (5/8), which were available to her in the vicinity of northern France⁸¹. Rudolf Weigand also commented on many mixed-recension manuscripts in his work on early glosses⁸². Titus Lenherr found that Mk (7/8), Bi (4/8), Py (1/8), and Sb (2/8), among dozens of manuscripts, contain readings closest to Gratian's formal sources⁸³. In her working edition of

80) FRIEDBERG, *Decretum* (as n. 3) p. xcv–xcix. Friedberg's other six manuscripts include Mm (as C, 8/8), Mc (as D, 8/8), Md (as E, 8/8), Ld (as F, 7/8), Wo (as G, 8/8), and Bh (as H), which I have not been able to examine. Three of Friedberg's manuscripts – Md, Wo, and Bh – also belong to the Sigma (Σ) group, a French revision of the *Decretum* which will be discussed below.

81) RAMBAUD-BUHOT, *Le legs* (as n. 20).

82) Among the manuscripts which contain the *First Gloss Composition* (Bologna, c. 1150) are Bi (4/8), Gt (0/8), Hk (6/8), Tt (1/4), and Vc (5/8). Other manuscripts which contain the *First Gloss Composition* often contain all or nearly all of the expansions. For Weigand's comprehensive study of glosses, see WEIGAND, *Die Glossen* (as n. 18). A helpful summary can be found in Rudolf WEIGAND, *The Development of the Glossa ordinaria to Gratian's Decretum*, in: HARTMANN / PENNINGTON, *The History* (as n. 2) p. 55–97.

83) In most cases, Lenherr's results can be explained by the preservation of first-recension readings in mixed-recension manuscripts; LENHERR, *Arbeiten* (as n. 21) p. 163. Lenherr has also identified nineteen manuscripts which contain early forms of the rubrics to canons from the Second Lateran Council (1139): Aa (1/8); An (6/8); Bi (4/8); Br (6/7); Hk (6/8); In (5/8); Ka (4/8); Kb (4/8); Mc (8/8);