

additions at C.11 q.3 and C.24 q.1–3 reveal, however, that all five of Gratian's main formal sources can be identified in the appendices of Aa, Bc, Fd, and Vx<sup>47</sup>. I have also analyzed each layer of additions for the use of certain minor sources which scholars have long suspected were added to the *Decretum* at a late stage of composition<sup>48</sup>. These sources include canons from the First and Second Lateran Councils (1123 and 1139), decrees of Paschal II (r. 1099–1118) and Innocent II (r. 1130–1143), and Roman law texts from Justinian's *Corpus iuris civilis*. Again, all of these sources can be witnessed in each layer of additions<sup>49</sup>:

---

47) The five major formal sources of both the first and second recensions are Ivo's *Tripartita* (IT), the *Panormia* (IP), Anselm of Lucca's *Collectio canonum* (AA), the *Collectio trium librorum* (DR), and the *Polycarpus* (PX). On these collections, see Linda FOWLER-MAGERL, *Clavis Canonum: Selected Canon Law Collections before 1140* (MGH Hilfsmittel 21, 2005); Lotte KÉRY, *Canonical Collections of the Early Middle Ages (ca. 400–1140)* (History of Medieval Canon Law, 1999). On Gratian's sources, see: WINROTH, *Making* (as n. 2) p. 15–18; Peter LANDAU, *Quellen und Bedeutung des gratianischen Dekrets*, in: *Studia et Documenta historiae et Iuris* 52 (1986) p. 218–35 (reprint in: *Kanones und Dekretalen* (as n. 18) p. 207\*–224\*); Peter LANDAU, *Neue Forschungen zu vorgratianischen Kanonensammlungen und den Quellen des gratianischen Dekrets*, in: *Ius Commune* 11 (1984) p. 1–29 (reprint in *Kanones und Dekretalen* (as n. 18) p. 177\*–205\*). By comparing my inventory of the additions in Aa, Bc, Fd, and Vx to the source tables for C.11 q.3 and C.24 qq.1–3 in WINROTH, *Making* (as n. 2) p. 34–121, it is possible to locate all five major sources in the appendices of Aa, Fd, and Vx.

48) WINROTH, *Making* (as n. 2) p. 13. On the potential late addition of texts from the Second Lateran Council, see LENHERR, *Die Summarien* (as n. 21) p. 528–31; Gérard FRANSEN, *La date du Décret de Gratien*, in: *RHE* 51 (1956) p. 521–31. On Roman law in the *Decretum*, see WINROTH, *Roman Law* (as n. 14); IDEM, *Making* (as n. 2) p. 146–74; VIEJO-XIMÉNEZ, *El Derecho Romano „nuevo“* (as n. 14); Stephan KUTTNER, *Additional Notes on the Roman Law in Gratian's Decretum*, in: *Seminar* 12 (1954) p. 68–74 (reprint in: *Gratian and the Schools* [as n. 18] no. V); IDEM, *New Studies on the Roman Law in Gratian's Decretum*, in: *Seminar* 11 (1953) p. 12–50 (reprint in: *Gratian and the Schools* (as n. 18) no. IV). See also the classic essays in VETULANI, *Sur Gratien* (as n. 19).

49) I have included in these tables only texts from the second recension, excluding both first-recension texts and *paleae* known to be later additions. For Roman law, I have combined the tables in FRIEDBERG, *Decretum* (as n. 3) p. xxxix–xl with the revised versions of Vetulani's tables in KUTTNER, *New Studies* (as n. 48) p. 19. For the Lateran councils, I have combined FRIEDBERG, *Decretum* (as n. 3) p. xxv with LENHERR, *Die Summarien* (as n. 21) p. 536–43. For the letters of Paschal II and Innocent II, I have relied on FRIEDBERG, *Decretum* (as n. 3) p. xxxi. The following abbreviations are employed: T = main text; A = appendix; M = margin. In order to save space, I have adopted the following shorthand for *Decretum* texts: 1.1 = D.1 c.1; 1.1.1 = C.1 q.1 c.1; DP = *De penitentia*; DC = *De consecratione*; p =