



AMERICAN

X 200-4

CONTENTS.

PAGE	
Epicurus and Cosmological Heresies. By FRIEDRICH SOLMSEN, - - - - -	1
The Prytaneion Decree Re-examined. By MARTIN OSTWALD, - - - - -	24
The Composition of <i>Anth. Pal.</i> , VII, 476 (Meleager). By STUART G. P. SMALL, - - - - -	47
Amafinius, Lucretius, and Cicero. By HERBERT M. HOWE, - - - - -	57
Two Greek Names for the Truffle. By WERNER WINTER, - - - - -	63
 REVIEWS: - - - - -	 69

Hanell's Das altrömische eponyme Amt (LILY ROSS TAYLOR).—"Manu." Introduction à l'histoire des religions—2: Les religions de l'Europe ancienne. III: *Grenier's Les religions étrusque et romaine*. *Vendryes*, *Tonnellat*, and *Unbegau's Les religions des Celtes, des Germains, et des anciens Slaves* (ARTHUR DARBY NOCK).—*Schachermeyr's Alexander der Große: Ingenium und Macht* (TRUSSARD S. BROWN).—*Hadas' A History of Greek Literature* (NORMAN W. DEWITT).—*Hofmann's Etymologisches Wörterbuch des Griechischen*. 1. Teil (ROLAND G. KENT).—*Eranos Rudbergianus*, Opuscula Philologica Gunnaro Rudberg a. d. XVI. Kal. Nov. Anno MCMXLV Dedicata (FRANCIS R. WALKER).—*Will's Horaz und die Augusteische Kultur* (FRANK O. COPELY).—*Thomson's History of Ancient Geography* (LIONEL PEARSON).—*Snell's Die Entdeckung des Geistes*. Studien zur Entstehung des europäischen Denkens bei den Griechen. Zweite erweiterte Auflage (KURT VON FRITZ).—*Oeri's Der Typ der komischen Alten in der griechischen Komödie*, seine Nachwirkungen und seine Herkunft (PHILIP WHALEY HARSH).—*Paap's De Herodoti reliquiis in papyris et membranis Aegyptiis servatis* (LIONEL PEARSON).—*Wendel's Die griechisch-römische Buchbeschreibung verglichen mit der des Vorderen Orients* (NAPHTALI LEWIS).—*Labourt's Saint Jérôme, Lettres*, Tome I (ARTHUR STANLEY PEASE).—*Cohen's La Grèce et l'Hellenisation du monde antique*. Nouvelle (Sième) édition (STERLING DOW).—*Kahle's The Cairo Geniza* (W. F. ALBRIGHT).—*Benveniste's Noms d'agent et noms d'action en indo-européen* (JAMES W. POULTNEY).—*Diringer's The Alphabet. A Key to the History of Mankind* (KEMP MALONE).—*Wyckerley's How the Greeks Built Cities* (J. H. YOUNG).—*Malcovati's Imperatoris Caesaris Augusti operum fragmenta*, 3rd ed. (JAMES H. OLIVER).

The American Journal of Philology is open to original communications in all departments of philology, and especially in the field of Greek and Roman studies. It is published quarterly. Four numbers constitute a volume, one volume each year. Subscription price, \$5.00 a year, payable in advance (foreign postage 25 cents extra); single numbers, \$1.50 each.

Articles intended for publication in the Journal, books for review, and other editorial communications should be addressed to the editor, Henry T. Rowell; proof should be returned to the secretary, Evelyn H. Clift, The Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore 18, Maryland.

Contributors are entitled to receive twenty-five copies of their respective contributions free of charge. Additional copies will be supplied at cost. Subscriptions, remittances, and business communications should be sent to

THE JOHNS HOPKINS PRESS, Baltimore 18, Md.

The contents of the American Journal of Philology are indexed regularly in the International Index to Periodicals.

Entered as second-class matter October 16, 1911, at the postoffice at Baltimore, Maryland, under the Act of March 3, 1879.

Acceptance for mailing at special rate of postage provided for in Section 1108, Act of October 3, 1917. Authorized on July 3, 1918.

Founded by B. L. GILDERSLEEVE

Edited by

HENRY T. ROWELL

KEMP MALONE, BENJAMIN D. MERITT, JAMES H. OLIVER

EVELYN H. CLIFT: Secretary

Honorary Editor

DAVID M. ROBINSON

VOLUME LXXII

MONUMENTA GERMANIAE
HISTORICA
Bibliothek

BALTIMORE: THE JOHNS HOPKINS PRESS

LONDON: ARTHUR F. BIRD

PARIS: ALBERT FONTENOING

LEIPZIG: F. A. BROOKHAUS

1951

ALCUIN'S EPITAPH OF HADRIAN I.*

A Study In Carolingian Epigraphy.

Alcuin is the author of many metrical inscriptions (*tituli*) for the altars and walls of churches and monasteries, and for epitaphs¹ and book dedications. None of his biographers has paid proper attention to this aspect of his many-sided activities. But even in the role of epigrapher, the versatile Anglo-Saxon is deserving of our interest. Edmond Le Blant² initiated the critical appraisal of Alcuin's epigraphic work, but since 1856 the subject has been neglected. There is sufficient material available to speak not only of the much discussed Scriptorium of Tours but also of the Epigraphic School of Tours.³ The best-known inscription of the school is the epitaph of Pope Hadrian I (772-795), placed on his tomb at Rome upon the request of Charlemagne. J. B. de Rossi⁴ concludes that the lapidary workmanship and the style of the inscription are without equal among contemporary epigraphic products of Rome or elsewhere. Its well-executed Roman square capital is fashioned after older Roman inscriptions, many of which were undoubtedly still extant at Tours during the time of Alcuin (796-804).⁵

The metrical epitaph consists of thirty-nine elegiacs and one dateline. There are never more than forty full-sized capitals to

* For more on Alcuin see my forthcoming study "The Via Regia of Charlemagne. The Rhetoric of Alcuin as a Treatise on Kingship." I am indebted to Professor Harry Caplan and to Professor James Hutton of Cornell University for critical reading of this paper.

¹ Cf. J. B. de Rossi, "Tituli et epitaphia vetera mixta carminibus Alcuini," *Inscriptiones Christianae Vrbis Romae Septimo Saeculo Antiquiores*, II, 1 (Rome, 1888), pp. 280-2.

² *Inscriptions Chrétiennes de la Gaule antérieures au VIII^e Siècle*, I (Paris, 1856), pp. cxxiii-iv.

³ C. Chevalier, *Les Fouilles de Saint-Martin de Tours* (Tours, 1888).

⁴ "L'Inscription du Tombeau d'Hadrien I, composée et gravée en France par ordre de Charlemagne," *École Française de Rome, Mélanges d'Archéologie et d'Histoire*, VIII (1888), pp. 478-501.

⁵ See J. Boussard, "Étude sur la ville de Tours du I^{er} au IV^e siècle," *Revue des Études Anciennes*, L (1948), pp. 312-29; H. Auvray, "La Touraine Gallo-Romaine," *Bulletin de la Société Archéologique de Touraine*, XXVII (1938).

a verse. The space-saving ligatures of two letters (*litterae contiguae*)⁶ are identical with those in inscriptions of the early Roman empire. In addition to the ordinary capital T, we thus encounter the archaic form of the letter as used during the empire, the heightened T, which extends above the upper rim of the letters so that its transverse line is above the preceding and the following capitals. The same form of the letter is used for the ligature of T and R, in which case the rounded arch of R is below the right branch of the elevated crossbeam of the letter, while the normal-sized T is used for the ligature of T and E. Other space-saving devices are the insertion of a small capital in the cavity of a rounded, large capital (*litterae insertae*) such as v in Q and C, and a in C, and finally the small capitals A, O, I, suspended halfway between two normal-sized letters. The *nomina sacra* of the inscription are identical with those occurring in manuscripts from the Scriptorium of Tours.⁷ The significance of the use by the engraver of two different ways of writing KAROLVS seems to have escaped the attention of de Rossi. The name is written KAROLVS (v. 24) and KAROLVS (v. 17). The occurrence of the second spelling in an inscription which originated, literally and technically, upon the request of the Frankish king, possesses more than a merely epigraphic meaning. The monogram spelling resembles the legend on the coins of Charlemagne.⁸ The public display of such a *nomisma nominis nostri* was an exclusive royal prerogative, a fact which was undoubtedly known to the engraver of the inscription.

The question that interests us is the disputed authorship of the inscription. Some scholars ascribe it to Charlemagne, relying on v. 17:

POST PATREM LACRIMANS KAROLVS HAEC CARMINA SCRIBSI,

⁶ See the lists of ligatures in René Cagnat, *Cours d'Épigraphie Latine* (4th ed., Paris, 1914), pp. 24-26; J. E. Sandys, *Latin Epigraphy* (2nd ed., by S. G. Campbell, Cambridge, 1927), p. 52.

⁷ E. K. Rand, *Studies in the Script of Tours*, II (Cambridge, Mass., 1934), pp. 44-45.

⁸ See the reproductions of Carolingian coins in *Dictionnaire d'Archéologie Chrétienne et de Liturgie*, III (Paris, 1913), 685; Anatole de Barthélémy, "Les Monnaies de Charlemagne," in A. Vétau, *Charlemagne* (3rd ed., Tours, 1888), pp. 523-30; *Capitulare Francofurtense* of 794, M. G. H., *Concilia*, I, p. 166, art. V: *nomisma nominis nostri*.

others assume Alcuin's authorship or reserve their judgment. Orazio Marucchi⁹ ascribes it to the king, Arthur Kleinlausz¹⁰ to Alcuin. The Bollandist Ianning¹¹ suggested the authorship of Alcuin on the basis of seven locutions in the epitaph for which he adduced parallels from the poems of Alcuin. L. Duchesne¹² mentioned Alcuin with reservation, while E. K. Rand¹³ concluded with de Rossi that the Anglo-Saxon is indeed the author of Hadrian's epitaph. Ernst Dümmler¹⁴ who noticed three stylistic parallels between the inscription and Alcuin's poetry, but not those previously listed by Ianning, did not include the metrical inscription among the poems of Alcuin. His edition of the epitaph is not based on the epigraphic evidence, but on the transmission in manuscripts. One of these contains a revision of the original text. Dümmler accordingly reads v. 14:

Urbis et orbis honor, inclyta Roma, tuas,

while the inscription offers:

VRBS CAPVT ORBIS HONOR INCLYTA ROMA TVAS.

The scribe of the manuscript used by Dümmler in this instance thus revised Alcuin's words after the epitaph of Hadrian I composed by Alcuin's friend Theodulph of Orléans,¹⁵ *Super Sepulchrum Hadriani Papae*, v. 9:

Tu decus ecclesiae, fax splendens urbis et orbis.

The following edition of Hadrian's epitaph¹⁶ endeavors to

⁹ *Christian Epigraphy* (tr. by J. A. Willis, Cambridge, 1912), p. 455.

¹⁰ *Alcuin* (Paris, 1948), p. 248; see my review in *Speculum*, XXIV (1949), pp. 587-90.

¹¹ *Acta Sanctorum Junii*, VII, 2 (1867), pp. 98-100.

¹² *Le Liber Pontificalis*, I (Paris, 1886), p. 553.

¹³ *Studies in the Script of Tours*, I (Cambridge, Mass., 1929), p. 41.

¹⁴ *M. G. H.*, Poetae, I, pp. 112-13.

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 489-90, no. XXVI.

¹⁶ See de Rossi (note 4), pp. 478-9, and the facsimile of the inscription provided by him; L. Duchesne (note 12), p. 523; Fedor Schneider und Walther Holtzmann, *Die Epitaphien der Päpste und andere stadt-römische Inschriften (Texte zur Kulturgeschichte des Mittelalters*, VI [Rome, 1933]); Ferdinand Gregorovius, *Le Tombe dei Papi* (sec. ed. ital. riv. et ampl. da C. Hülsen, Rome, 1931); H. Leclercq, "Épitaphe d'Hadrien Ier," *Dictionnaire d'Archéologie Chrétienne et de Liturgie*, VI (Paris, 1925), 1964-7; also XIII (1937), 1255-64; an English trans-

prove the authorship of Alcuin on the basis of the numerous parallels between the inscription and Alcuin's poetry.¹⁷

The Epitaph of Pope Hadrian I (772-795)

(today in the Portico of St. Peter's at Rome)

- 1 *Hic pater ecclesiae, Romae decus, inclytus auctor
Hadrianus requiem papa beatus habet.*
*Vir cui vita Deus, pietas lex, gloria Christus,
Pastor apostolicus, promptus ad omne bonum,*
- 5 *Nobilis ex magna genitrix iam gente parentum,
Sed sacris longe nobilior meritis,
Exornare studens devoto pectore pastor,
Semper ubique suo templo sacra Deo,
Ecclesias donis, populos et dogmate sancto*
- 10 *Imbuit et cunctis pandit ad astra viam.
Pauperibus largus, nulli pietate secundus,
Et pro plebe sacris pervigil in precibus,
Doctrinis, opibus, muris exerat arces,
Urbs caput orbis honor, inclyta Roma, tuas.*
- 15 *Mors cui nil nocuit, Christi quae morte perempta est,
Janua sed vitae mox melioris erat.
Post patrem lacrimans Karolus haec carmina scripsi,
Tu mihi dulcis amor, te modo plango, pater.
Tu memor esto mei, sequitur te mens mea semper,*
- 20 *Cum Christo teneas regna beata poli.
Te clerus, populus magno dilexit amore,
Omnibus unus amor, optime praesul, eras.
Nomina iungo simul titulis, clarissime, nostra,
Hadrianus Karolus, rex ego tuque pater.*
- 25 *Quisque legas versus, devoto pectore supplex:
'Amborum mitis,' dic, 'miserere Deus.'
Haec tua nunc teneat requies, carissime, membra,
Cum sanctis anima gaudeat alma Dei.*

lation of Hadrian's epitaph is provided by Jacob Isidor Mombert, *A History of Charles the Great* (New York, 1886), pp. 337-8.

¹⁷ Abbreviations used in the commentary:

- | | |
|------------|--|
| C. L. E. | — <i>Carmina Latina Epigraphica</i> , ed. Buecheler and Lommatzsch; |
| de Rossi | — J. B. de Rossi, <i>Inscriptiones Christianae Vrbis Romae</i> , I-II, 1 (Rome, 1888); |
| Diehl | — Ernestus Diehl, <i>Inscriptiones Latinae Christianae Veteres</i> , I-III (Berlin, 1926-1931); |
| Fortunatus | — Venantius Fortunatus, ed. Friedrich Leo, <i>M. G. H.</i> , <i>Autores Antiquissimi</i> , IV, 1; IV, 2, ed. Bruno Krusch; |
| Ianning | — <i>Acta Sanctorum Junii</i> , VII, 2 (1867), p. 99; |
| Dümmler | — <i>M. G. H.</i> , Poetae, I, p. 112. |

30 *Ultima quippe tuas donec tuba clamat in aures,
Principe cum Petro surge videre Deum.
Auditurus eris vocem, scio, iudicis almam:
‘Intra nunc domini gaudia magna tui.’
Tunc memor esto tui nati, pater optime, posco:
‘Cum patre,’ dic, ‘natus pergit et iste meus.’
35 O pote regna, pater felix, cœlestia Christi;
Inde tuum precibus auxiliare gregem.
Dum sol ignicomo rutilus splendescit ab axe,
Laus tua, sancte pater, semper in orbe manet.
Sedit beatæ memoriae Hadrianus papa
40 Annos XXIII menses X dies XVII obiit VII Kalendas
Ianuarias.*

- 1 *Romae decus]* Cf. Publ. Optat. Porfyrius, *Carmina*, X, 21 ed. Elsa Kluge (Teubner, 1926): *Concordi saeclo Romae decus*; II, 19: *Alme, salus orbis, Romae decus, inclyta fama;* cf. Alcuin in Poem on York, v. 455 (p. 179): *Inclyta fama viri nec solum iure Britannos illustrat populos.* Cf. Bede, *Hist. Eccl.*, III, 13. *inclytus auctor]* Alcuin, *Epit. Pauli Monachi Turonensis*, CXIII, 17 (p. 344), cited by Ianning: *Mox Martinus amor rapuit me inclitus auctor;* *Vita Willibrordi*, II, 3, 1 (p. 210): *Crescere Pippinus dum viderat inclitus auctor;* in Poem addressed to Paulinus of Aquileia, XVII, 14 (p. 239), cited by Ianning: *O laus Ausoniæ, patriæ decus, inclitus auctor;* *Epit. Civitatis Papiae*, M. G. H., *Poetae*, I, p. 102, no. I, 1, 3: *Et pater et pastor, patriæ decus, inclitus auctor;* cf. Virgil, *Aen.*, VII, 134: *Dardanus . . . pater urbis et auctor.*
- 4 *Pastor apostolicus]* Alcuin, XLV, 69 (p. 259); *Vita Willibrordi* II, 3, 6 (p. 210). *promptus ad omne bonum]* *Vita Willibrordi*, II, 34, 38 (p. 219), cited by Dümmler; in two epitaphs: XCIX, 13, 4 (p. 325), and XCII, 2, 6 (p. 319): *Hic decus ecclesiae, promptus in omne bonum;* Alcuin's model is Fortunatus, II, 11, 19-20: *Ecclesiae fultor, laus regum, pastor egentum,* *Cura sacerdotum, promptus ad omne bonum;* the locution occurs in the following Carolingian epitaphs: *Ep. Polradi*, ed. M. G. H., *Poetae*, I, p. 404, no. XII, 14, cited by Dümmler; *Ep. Grimoaldi*, p. 430, 16; *Ep. Godefridi*, M. G. H., *Poetae*, II, p. 652, no. IV, 6; Diehl, 4766, 4 (Rome), without reference to Fortunatus.
- 5-6 Alcuin, *Vita Willibrordi*, II, 33, 1-2 (p. 218), cited by Dümmler: *Nobilis iste fuit magna de gente sacerdos,* *Sed magnis multis nobilior meritis;* in the Poem on York, vv. 752-4 (p. 186):

Acceptit sponsam Adiltrudam nomine dictam,
Nobilium genitam regali stirpe parentum,
Nobilior longe casta quae mente manebat;
ibid., vv. 1250-1 (p. 197):

Hic fuit Ecgbertus regali stirpe creatus,
Nobilium eorum saeclo radice parentum,
Sed domino eorum meritis præclarior almis.

Alcuin uses consistently the figure of *antimetabole* in these characterizations; see also Otto Weinreich, "Ueber einige panegyrische Topoi der Schönheits- und Charakterschilderung," *Würzburger Jahrbücher für die Altertumswissenschaft*, I (1946), pp. 121-3. Alcuin's source is Fortunatus, IV, 8, 11-12:

Nobilis antiquo veniens de germine patrum,
Sed magis in Christo nobilior meritis;
Nobilis et merito nobiliore potens (IV, 13, 4);
Nobilis antiqua decurrentis prole parentum,
Nobilior gestis nunc super astra manet (IV, 2, 5);
Nobilitas in gente sua cui celsa refusit
Atque suis meritis additur alter honor (IV, 26, 37).

7 *Exornare studens]* Alcuin in the Poem on York, v. 1027 (p. 192): *Exornans ovibus Christi studiosus alendis;* *devoto pectore]* Alcuin, *ibid.*, v. 1256 (p. 197):

Pauperibus tribuens devoto pectore gazas; Alcuin, LXVIII, 22 (p. 287); Sedulius, *Carm. Pasch.*, V, 350; Iuvencus, *Evang. Libri Quattuor*, I, 610; Diehl, 611, 1 (Rome).

8 *Semper ubique]* A favorite locution of Alcuin; cf. CXIII, 30 (p. 344), cited by Ianning:

Vosque valete mei semper ubique deo;
Atque dies nostros precibus rege semper ubique
(XCIX, 12, 11);
Semper ubique vale, dic dic, dulcissime David,
David amor Flacci, semper ubique vale
(XXXVII, 7-8, p. 252);

Semper ubique deo, peto, vos estote fideles
(X, 16, p. 236);
cf. *Act. Apost.*, 24, 3: *Semper et ubique suscepimus.*
templa sacra deo] Alcuin, LXIX, 118 (p. 290); Ovid, *Fasti*, I, 706: *templa dicata deis.*

9 Alcuin in the Poem on York, v. 275, p. 175:

Exruit ecclesiæ donisque exornat opimis;
ibid., v. 1228, p. 196:
Ecclesiæ alias donis ornavit opimis.

10 Alcuin in the Poem on York, v. 1652, p. 206:

Imbuit et primis utcumque verenter ab annis;
cf. *C. L. E.*, 669, 2 (Rome): . . . *fecit ad astra viam;* cf. Propertius, III, 18, 34: *ab humana cessit in astra viam.*

- 11 *Pauperibus largus*] Alcuin, *Versus ad Leonem Papam*, XV, 6 (p. 238):
Pauperibus largus, clarus honore pio;
Ad Friducinum, XLVI, 14 (p. 259):
Pauperibus largus ceu miserisque pater;
 in the Poem on York, v. 269 (p. 175):
Pauperibus largus, parcus sibi, dives in omnes;
ibid., v. 1018 (p. 192):
Pauperibus largus, sibimet sed semper egenus;
 cf. Epitaph of Pope Felix IV, Diehl, 986, 5 (Rome):
Pauperibus largus, miseris solatia praestans;
 epitaph of Marca, Diehl, 989, 9 (Rome):
Pauperibus largus vixisti, nulla reservans;
 sylloge of Tours, ed. de Rossi, II, 1, p. 67, no. 25, 3-4:
Pauperibus larga distribuere manu;
 sylloge of Verdun, Diehl, 1135, 7 (Rome):
Largus pauperibus dives tibi carus amicis;
 Diehl, 1678, 11 (Vienne):
Semper devota suis, pauperibus larga;
 epitaph Siconis principis of 832, *M. G. H.*, *Poetae*, II, 648, no. 2, 36:
Largus et in cunctis pauperibusque pius;
 epitaph of Hugo Lausannensis episcopus (d. 1038), *M. G. H.*, *Scriptores*, XXIV, p. 799, 25:
Pauperibus largus fuerat viduisque maritus;
 Pseudo-Turpin, epitaph of Roland, *M. G. H.*, *Poetae*, I, p. 110, 10:
Largus pauperibus, prodigus hospitibus.
 Cf. Arator, *Act. Apost.*, I, 835: pauperibus quae larga fuit; Bede, *Hist. Eccl.*, III, 6: pauperibus et . . . largus.
- 11 *nulli pietate secundus*] Alcuin, CIX, 24, 11 (p. 340), cited by Ianning:
Vir pius et prudens, nulli pietate secundus;
 Alcuin, *Vita Willibrordi*, II, 4, 3 (p. 210):
Vir bonus et prudens, nulli pietate secundus;
 cf. Alexander Riese, *Anthologia Latina*, I (1894), p. 8, cited by Dümmler:
Vir magnus bello, nulli pietate secundus;
 epitaph of Louis the Pious of 840, *M. G. H.*, *Poetae*, II, p. 654, 5:
Hic fidus, fortis, nulli pietate secundus;
 cf. Fortunatus, IV, 9, 11-13:
Egregius, nulli de nobilitate secundus;
 Virgil, *Aen.*, XI, 441: ulli veterum virtute secundus.
- 12 Alcuin, XCI, 2, 3 (p. 317):
Pervigiles precibus iam, vos insistite sacris;
 in the Poem on York, v. 1196, p. 195:
At vigil in precibus perstabat nocte sacerdos;
 XCI, 3, 7 (p. 318):
Pervigil idcirco magnum tibi conde triumphum.

- 13 Alcuin, XXV, 1, 1-3 (p. 245), cited by Ianning:
Salve, Roma potens, mundi decus, inclita mater;
Et caput orbis, honor magnus, Leo papa valet.
 XXI, 5 (p. 242), cited by Ianning:
Urbs, caput orbis, habet te maxima Roma magistrum;
 XLV, 31, 63 (p. 258), IX, 37 (p. 230):
Roma, caput mundi, mundi decus, aurea Roma;
Vita Willibrordi, I, 32 ed. Wilhelm Levison, *M. G. H.*, *Scriptores Rerum Merovingicarum*, VII, p. 139, 7: Roma urbs, orbis caput; cf. Ovid, *Fasti*, V, 93: hic, ubi nunc Roma est, orbis caput; *Amor.*, I, 15, 26: Roma triumphati dum caput orbis erit; *Met.*, XV, 435; *Trist.*, III, 5, 46. The Roman Church is called by Hadrian in letters to Charlemagne: caput totius mundi; see *Codex Carolinus*, ed. Gundlach, *M. G. H.*, *Epistolae Meroving. et Karolini Aevi*, I, 72, pp. 602-3, no. 94, p. 636, 5.
incliuta Roma] Virgil, *Aen.*, VI, 781; Prudentius, *Contra orationem Symmachii*, I, 553; II, 357; Alcuin was familiar with Prudentius; see CXXIII, 13 (p. 350):
Cur Tyrio corpus inhias vestirier ostro,
 and Prudentius, *Peristephanon*, 388: corporisque piis inhias; *Psychomachia*, 39: floribus ardentique iubet *vestirier ostro*; cf. Virgil, *Georg.*, III, 17: Ego Tyrio conspectus in ostro; Ovid, *Ep.*, XII, 179; *Met.*, X, 211.
- 15 Alcuin, XXII, 3, 7 (p. 319):
Sed quem Christus amat, illi mors nulla nocebit;
 cf. I. Cor. 15, 54-55; Diehl, 64, 7 (Rome): nil tibi mors nocuit; Diehl, 244, 9 (Rome): non multum, mors dira, noces; Diehl, 170, 7 (Salerno): sed tibi nil potuit mors haec tam saeva nocere; *Epitaph. Marii episcopi Aventicensis*, ed. Th. Mommsen, *M. G. H.*, *Auct. Antt.*, XI, p. 227:
Mors infesta ruens quamvis ex lege parentis,
Moribus instructis nulla nocere potest;
C. L. E., 1361, 8 (Ansa, Lugdunensis): mors nihil est; *Epit. Grimoldi* of 807, *M. G. H.*, *Poetae*, I, p. 43, 37:
Mors tibi non nocuit;
 cf. Lucretius, III, 830 on the folly of the fear of death:
Nil igitur mors est ad nos neque pertinet hilum.
morte perempta] Dracontius, *De laudibus Dei*, I, 649:
Ac sine morte tamen vitali in morte perempta;
 Virgil, *Aen.* VI, 163: indigna morte peremptum.
- 16 Alcuin, IX, 147 (p. 232):
Sed magis ad studium vitae melioris abundet;
 CVII, 2, 13 (p. 334): ianua vitae; XCIX, 22, 3 (p. 327): vitae melioris amator; cf. Alcuin in *Epistle* 266, p. 424, 33 (*M. G. H.*, *Epistolae*, IV): novi . . . et renovetur vita mea in melius (i. e., after death).

- 17 Alcuin in the Poem on York, vv. 1653-4, p. 206:
*Haec idcirco cui propriis de patribus atque
 Regibus et sanctis ruralia carmina scripsi;*
 cf. C. L. E., 1988, 35 (Rome): hos tibi dat versus *lachrimans sine
 fine patronus*; Eginhard, *Vita Caroli*, ch. XIX, reports: Nuntiato
 sibi Adriano Romani pontificis obitu, quem in amicis praecipuum
 habebat, sic flevit aesi fratrem aut filium amisisset karissimum.
 On references in the letters of Alcuin on the death of Hadrian see
 Bernhard Simson, *Jahrbücher des Fränkischen Reiches unter Karl
 d. Gr.*, II (Leipzig, 1883), p. 109, note 4.
- 18 Alcuin, LV, 1, 10 (p. 266):
*Dulcis amor lacrimis absentem plangit amicum;
 Tu requies mentem, tu mihi dulcis amor;*
 IX, 191 (p. 234):
Tecum plango tuos casus, karissime frater.
- 18-19 Alcuin, XXIX, 3-4 (p. 248):
*Tu mihi dulcis amor, cordis tu carmen in ore,
 Tu memor esto mihi, tu sine fine vale;*
Tu mihi dulcis amor (already cited by Ianning) is a favorite locution
 of Alcuin; see XLI, 1 (p. 253), XXXV, 3 (p. 251), XC, 6
 (p. 313). Cf. Bede, *Vita S. Cuthberti*, XLV, 924, ed. Werner
 Jaager, *Palaestra*, 198 (Leipzig, 1925): *Hoc te, dulcis amor;*
 Sedulius, *Hymnus*, I, 2: *Dulcis amor*; Ovid, *Fasti*, V, 653: *dulci
 . . . amore.*
- 19 Alcuin, *Versus ad Leonem Apostolicum*, XLIV, 1 (p. 255):
Te mea mens sequitur, carissime Candide, triste;
Ad Amicos, LII, 3 (p. 265):
Te mea mens sequitur, magno cum corde amore;
Versus ad Carolum Imp., XLV, 17 (p. 257):
Te mea mens sequitur, sequitur quoque carmen amoris;
 Hrabanus Maurus, Alcuin's pupil, repeats this locution in his *Carmina*, M. G. H., *Poetae*, II, p. 188, no. XXV, 7, p. 170, no. VI, 15;
 cf. Virgil, *Aen.*, X, 182: *mentes omnibus sua sequendi.*
- 20 Alcuin, *Versus ad Carolum Imp.*, XLV, 14 (p. 257):
Cum Christo teneat regna beata poli;
 Alcuin in letter to Beatus of Liebana, ed. Wilhelm Levison, *England
 and the Continent in the Eighth Century* (Oxford, 1946), p. 323, 18:
Cum sanctis teneas regna beata poli;
 cf. Ovid, *Ep.*, I, 106: *regna tenere potest*; *Ep.*, XII, 24: *regna
 beata.*
- Alcuin, LXIX, 176 (p. 292):
Vel praecepta dei, aut regna beata poli;
 Diehl, 1043, 2 (Milan):
Aurelius penetrans regna beata poli.
- 21 Cf. C. L. E., III, 2107, 3 (Madaura): *non inmerito magno dilexit
 amore*; Virgil, *Aen.*, I, 344: *et magno miserae dilectus amore.*

- 22 Alcuin, *De fide s. trinitatis*, XX (Migne, P. L., CI, 54B): *Unus
 amor omnibus;*
 Alcuin, LXV, 4a, 18 (p. 285):
Unus amor, lector, qui sit tibi semper in aevum;
 cf. *Epit. Pippini*, M. G. H., *Poetae*, I, p. 405, 13-15:
Unus amor populi, virtus, pax omnibus una,
Dilexit eunctos, unus amor populi;
 cf. C. L. E., 491, 2 (Faventia):
Unus amor mansit, par quoque vita fidelis;
 cf. Fortunatus, VI, 1, 68: *amor populi.*
- 23-24 This idea of friendship is the same as that expressed by Alcuin,
 LII, 17-18 (p. 265):
Quos caritate pia terris coniunxit amicos,
Gaudentes pariter iungat in arce poli;
 on the close friendship between king and pope see Erich Caspar,
"Hadrian I und Karl der Grosse," Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte,
 LIV (1935), pp. 150-214. Hadrian calls the Frankish king *com-
 pater spiritualis* in the *salutatio* of many letters; cf. M. G. H.,
Epistolae Merov. et Carolini Aevi, I, pp. 594 ff.; also M. G. H.,
Epistolae Karolini Aevi, III, p. 6, 16.
- 25 *Quisque legas versus]* Alcuin in the two inscriptions LXXXVII,
 14, 5 (p. 308); XCIX, 44 (p. 324); the locution expresses the
 wish that travelers will read the inscription; see the examples col-
 lected by Ewald Lissberger, *Das Fortleben der Römischen Elegiker
 in den Carmina Epigraphica* (Tübingen diss., 1934), p. 134.
devoto pectore supplices] Alcuin, LXV, 1a, 17 (p. 285):
Quae pater Albinus devoto pectore supplices;
 Diehl, 1810, 2 (Vienne):
Tu quaeccumque (venes) devoto pectore supplices.
- 27 Alcuin, CXXIII, 12 (p. 350): *me tenet hic requies.*
- 29 *Ultima . . . a reminiscence of Virgil, *Ecl.*, IV, 4-7:*
Ultima Cumaei venit iam carminis aetas.
- 29-30 Alcuin, CXXIII, 20-23 (p. 350) in his own epitaph, written by
 himself shortly before 804:
*Personet angelica donec ab arce tuba:
 Qui iaces in tumulo, terrae de pulvere surge,
 Magnus adest iudex milibus innumeris;*
 XV, 9-13 (p. 338), *In Cimiterio S. Amandi:*
*Donec ab aetheria clamet pius angelus arce:
 Surgite nunc prouptim terrae de pulvere, fratres,
 Vos vocat adveniens index ex culmine caeli;*
 cf. I. Cor. 15, 52: *tuba: canet enim, et mortui resurgent incorrupti;*
 cf. I. Thess. 4, 16; Matth. 24, 31.
- 31-33 Alcuin, L, 27-30 (p. 263):
*Felix ille dies, vocem qua iudicis almi
 Auditurus eris, proque labore tuo.*

- Tunc gaudens: 'Intra, nimium me serve fidelis
 Aeterni aeternus regna beata patris.'
Tunc memor esto mei et dic . . .
 LXXXVIII, 2, 9-10 (p. 309), *Ad Corpus Sancti Vedasti*:
Audiet idcirco vocem mox iudicis almi:
'Intra nunc domini gaudia sancta tui';
 cf. Ovid, *Met.*, VI, 548: *Audiet haec aether et si deus ullus in illo est;* cf. Lestocquo, "Notes sur l'épigraphie de l'abbaye de S. Vaast. Les Inscriptions d'Alcuin," *Commission départementale des Monuments Historiques du Pas-de-Calais, Bulletin*, N. S. VII (1941); Alcuin imitates Fortunatus, V, 2, 57-60:
Ecce tui domini modo gaudia laetior intra
Proque labore brevi magna parata tibi.
Auditurus eris vocem, Martine, beatam,
Sed Fortunati sis memor ipse tui. Cf. Psalm. 94, 8.
 32 Cf. Matth. 25, 21 (Luc. 19, 17); Ovid, *Amor.*, II, 9, 44: *Gaudia magna feram.*
 33 Alcuin, *Versus ad Paulinum*, XX, 40 (p. 241):
Qua memor esto tui nati, te posco per illum;
pater optime! Alcuin, CII, 14 (p. 329) and in letter to Hadrian of 794, *M. G. H.*, *Epistolae*, IV, 27, p. 68, 15.
 35 Alcuin, XX, 41 (p. 241):
Ut tibi cum sanctis tribuat caelestia regna;
 also X, 19 (p. 236); LXII, 4 (p. 275); v. 994, p. 191; cf. Ovid, *Ea Ponto*, IV, 8, 59: *caelestia regna*; *C. L. E.*, 671, 3:
confessus Christum caelestia regna petisti;
 cf. *C. L. E.*, 1400, I (Rome).
 36 Alcuin, *Epit. Monachi Pauli Turonensis*, CXIII, 9-10 (p. 344):
Auxiliare piis, te precor, et precibus;
 also LI, 6, 7 (p. 264), CIX, 16, 1 (p. 338), L, 36 (p. 263), II, 34, 82 (p. 220), IX, 178 (p. 233).
 37 Alcuin, XCV, 7 (p. 320):
Sol rutilans radiis domibus splendescit in altis;
 Alcuin's source is Iuvencus, *Evang. Libri Quattuor*, IV, 149-51, 158:
Abscondet furvis rutilos umbris radios sol,
Amittet cursum lunaris gratia lucis
Ignicomaeque ruent stellae caelumque relinquunt;
. . . ab axe;
 Iuvencus, III, 1:
Fuderat in terras roseum iubar ignicomus sol.
 38 Alcuin, *Ad Leonem apostolicum urbis Romae*, XLIII, 11-12 (p. 255):
Ut laus et merces maneat tibi, sancte sacerdos,
Tempore perpetuo pacis in orbe sacro;
 XXI, 33 (p. 243):
Sic tua laus crescit, merces sic magna manebit
Pastori summo sedis apostolicae;

IV, 19 (p. 221):

Die: *Tua laus tecum semper, dilecte, manebit;*Since Alcuin connects *sol* (v. 37) and *laus* (v. 38), it seems that he imitates Fortunatus, *Ad Justinum et Sophiam Augustos* (p. 276, 47):*Haec tua laus, princeps, cum sole cœcurrit in orbe;*Hrabanus Maurus, *M. G. H.*, *Poetae*, II, p. 161, no. III, 17, addressing Pope Gregory IV (827-844), seems to copy Alcuin:*Ut tua laus maneat, merces et gloria semper.*

- 40 Bernhard Simson,
- Jahrbücher des Fränkischen Reiches unter Karl dem Grossen*
- , II (Leipzig, 1883), p. 108, note 2, assumes that VIII Kal. Ian. is the correct date.

The numerous parallels in Hadrian's epitaph with the phraseology and the diction in Alcuin's metrical inscriptions and in his occasional poetry which we adduce in the notes of the commentary provide, as we hope, ample evidence that Alcuin is indeed the author of the inscription whose unity of composition and spontaneity of expression cannot be the work of a versifier who imitated the style of Alcuin's poetry.

Alcuin's interpretations of death, immortality, and resurrection pose a problem.¹⁸ Death is pictured as the separation of body and soul by which another life (16) better than the earthly is introduced; death therefore does not cause harm to man (15). The body is held in the tomb (21), while the soul makes for the stars (10), *spiritus astra petit* (see below), joining with the Saints (28). He believes in the immortality of the soul, and the disintegration of the body in dust, as may also be deduced from his own epitaph, where the traveler (*viator*) is asked (CXXIII, 9-10, p. 350):

Quapropter potius animam curare memento
 Quam carnem, quoniam haec manet, illa perit.

References in Hadrian's and Alcuin's epitaphs reveal their author's belief in an immortal soul freed of its body. "The soul returns to the judgment of Him who gave it," Alcuin wrote to his friend Arno of Salzburg;¹⁹ "I tremble with terror at the

¹⁸ On the contents of epitaphs see now Richmond Lattimore, *Themes in Greek and Latin Epitaphs* (*Illinois Studies in Language and Literature*, XXVIII, nos. 1-2 [Urbana, 1942]), pp. 301-40; especially pp. 309-11, on heretical concepts in Christian inscriptions.

¹⁹ Alcuin, *Epistle*, 239, p. 384, 29-33 (*M. G. H.*, *Epistolae*, IV, ed. Ernst Dümmler): *Spiritus revertatur ad iudicium illius qui dedit eum.*

thought of Judgment Day . . . lest He finds me unprepared." His vision of an incorporeally immortal soul is a remnant of ancient Greek thought that is contrary to the orthodox Christian point of view of a corporeal resurrection of the flesh from the dust of the grave. But the heretical concept is also found in other epitaphs of the early Middle Ages. Both concepts of resurrection appear in a rather incongruous fashion simultaneously in Alcuin's epitaph written by himself shortly before 804. Not only the resurrection of the soul (see above), but also the resurrection of the body is mentioned in the same epitaph (CXXIII, 21, p. 350):

Qui iaces in tumulo, terrae de pulvere surge.

The idea of the harmlessness of death (15) and the belief in the immortality of the soul determine Alcuin's expression of consolation in Hadrian's epitaph. They make it rather futile to deplore the loss of the departed; instead the *consolatio* is directed toward the living. This results in the panegyric and didactic praise of the virtues of Hadrian (3-6, 11-12), and the laudatory description of his achievements (7-9, 13-14). The inscription appears accordingly as a biographical *encomium* whose climax in the concluding *laudatio*²⁰ of v. 38,

LAVS TVA SANCTE PATER SEMPER IN ORBE MANET,

is inspired by Virgil's famous phrase (*Ecl.*, V, 78 = *Aen.*, I, 609):

Semper honos nomenque tuum laudesque manebunt,
a verse which is literally quoted by Alcuin in the epic poem on his native York (v. 1595, p. 205).

The extremely literary character of Hadrian's epitaph is obvious from the use made of Roman and Christian literary

Huius vero iudicii terrore totus contremesco . . . ne me minus paratum dies illa per omnia inveniat.

²⁰ On the classical *laudatio* see Marcel Durry, "Laudatio funebris et Rhétorique," *Revue de Philologie*, LXVIII (1942), pp. 105-14; cf. Konrat Ziegler, "Panegyrikos," *R.-E.*, XVIII, 1 (1949), cols. 559-81; on *consolatio* see Skutsch in *R.-E.*, IV, cols. 933 ff.; thus far, the literary genres in medieval epitaphs and in the panegyric Latin poetry from Fortunatus to Alcuin have not been investigated; they continue frequently the corresponding classical traditions.

sources. The influence of Porphyrius (1), Iuvencus (37), and Prudentius (14), is surpassed by that of Fortunatus²¹ (4, 5-6, 11, 14, 31-33), a favorite author of Alcuin. There are a few quotations and possible traces of Virgil and Ovid. A faint echo of the *Fourth Eclogue*²² (29), for the Middle Ages the messianic eclogue which foretold the birth of Christ and the return of Saturn's golden age of peace, seems to be contained in verse 29 in connection with the belief in the resurrection.

Formulæ of medieval epigraphy are the traditional *HIC . . . REQUIE[SCIT]* (1-2), *PROMPTVS IN OMNE BONVM* (4), *PAUPERIBVS LARGVS* (11), *NVLLI PIETATE SECUNDVS* (11); literary *topoi* are the obligation to top noble birth by a nobler life (5-6), the harmlessness of death (15) as the portal leading to a better life (16), and the incorporeal resurrection of the immortal soul (27-30).

A third source of Alcuin seems to be a *sylloge* (or several collections) of inscriptions which furnished him with some of those locutions for which parallels from Carolingian epitaphs, prior and posterior to Hadrian's, are adduced in our commentary (4, 11, 15, 20). Wilhelm Levison²³ has already called attention to the use made by Alcuin of the *Sylloge Cantabrigiensis*,²⁴ a collection of papal epitaphs and inscriptions. Alcuin was, in all probability, also familiar with the *Sylloge of Tours* (cf. 11). The use of the locution *iustitiae cultor*, for instance, which occurs in Roman and Christian inscriptions, becomes understandable if we assume Alcuin's possible familiarity with some sylloge. Compare the following examples: Alcuin, *Inscriptio in Monasterio Nobiliacensi*, XCIX, 22, 3-4 (p. 327):

Iustitiae cultor, vitae melioris amator,
Providus ingenio, cautus in eloquio;

²¹ On Alcuin's use see D. Tardi, *Fortunat* (Paris, 1927), p. 277; Max Manilius in *M. G. H., Auctores Antiquissimi*, IV, 2, pp. 137-8.

²² Karl Streckner, "Iam nova progenies caelo demittitur," *Studi Medievali*, V (1932), pp. 167-86.

²³ *England and the Continent in the Eighth Century* (Oxford, 1946), p. 162, note 2.

²⁴ Edited by Wilhelm Levison, "Englische Handschriften des Liber Pontificalis," *Neues Archiv*, XXXV (1910), pp. 350-66. Angelo Silvagni, "La Sylloge Epigrafica di Cambridge," *Rivista di Archeologia Cristiana*, XX (1948), pp. 49-112.

Versus ad Leonem Papam, XV, 5-6 (p. 238):

Iustitiae cultor, verae et pietatis amator,
Pauperibus largus, clarus honore pio;

Versus ad Paulinum (of Aquileia), XVII, 15 (p. 239):

Iustitiae cultor, sacrae pietatis amator;

Versus ad Leonem Apostolicum, XLIII, 5 (p. 254):

Iustitiae cultor, sancte et pietatis amator,²⁵
Firmus in officiis, verus in eloquiis;

In the Poem on York, v. 138 (p. 172):

Qui fuit ore simul verax et pectore prudens,
Iustitiae cultor, verus pietatis amator.

The last verse is identical with the third in a poem by Alcuin's teacher Aelbert or Koaena of York attached to a letter addressed to Lullus of Mayence.²⁶

The unknown Carolingian author²⁷ of the epic poem *Karolus Magnus et Leo Papa*²⁸ says of his hero:

Iustitiae cultor, cultores diligit omnes.

The original source of *iustitiae cultor* is Lucan, *Pharsalia* II, 389:

Iustitiae cultor, rigidi servator honesti,

a passage frequently referred to in Roman and Christian epitaphs. It appears in the *Sylloge of Tours* (Diehl 1195, 9-10):

Iustitiae cultor, vitae servator honestae,
Pauperibus dives, sed sibi pauper erat.

Occasionally, the passage from Lucan is connected with Martial, IX, 84, 4:

ille tuae cultor notus amicitiae,

²⁶ *Pietatis amator* is often used as *Verschluss*, also by Paul the Deacon, *M. G. H., Poetae*, I, p. 68, no. XXXIV, 10; Fortunatus, III, 22, 5; Dracontius, *De Deo*, III, 16; *iustitiae cultor*, see also in Diehl, 1011, 7; 1051, 6; Fortunatus, VI, 1a, 21; *Epit. Marii Episc. Aventicensis*, ed. Th. Mommsen, *M. G. H., Auct. Antt.*, XI, p. 227.

²⁷ *M. G. H., Poetae*, I, p. 201, note 1.

²⁸ D. Tardi, "Fortunat et Angilbert," *Bulletin Du Cange*, II (1925), pp. 30-38, ascribes the fragment to Angilbert; Otto Schumann, "Berno-wini episcopi carmina," *Historische Vierteljahrsschrift*, XXVI (1931), p. 226, denies Angilbert's authorship.

²⁹ *M. G. H., Poetae*, I, p. 367, no. VI, 31-32.

as in the following epitaphs of two Roman senators: Diehl, 243, 7-8:

purus amicitiae cultor, servator honesti,
eloquio miseros vel pietate iuvans;

Diehl, 135, 11-12:

fidus amicitiae custos, ambitor honesti,
iustitiae cultor, pacis amator eras.

The identification of *cultor* with *amator* in the last inscription is traceable to another interpretation of the passage from Lucan with the help of Ovid, *Ars Amatoria*, I, 722:

Qui fuerat cultor, factus amator erat,

as for instance in Diehl, 1024, 3:

Cultor iustitiae, doctrine et pacis amator,

and in the examples adduced from Alcuin's poetry.

Alcuin employs *iustitiae cultor* not only for epigraphic but also for merely literary purposes. In the same way he used the epigraphic formula *spiritus astra petit* (Diehl, 990, 3), *Vita Willibrordi*, II, 28, 4 (p. 216):

Spiritus astra petit meritis vivacibus alta;

in the Poem on York, v. 739 (p. 186):

... sub quo

Spiritus astra petit sancti terrena relinquens.

Alcuin's method conforms to the custom followed by Carolingian writers of fashioning dedicatory verses, for instance, after the inscriptions of a *sylloge*. A good example is found in the *Versus Godescalci in Carolum*, *M. G. H., Poetae*, I, p. 94, no. VII, 2, 6-9:

6 *Praelatus multis, humili pietate superbus,*
Providus ac sapiens, studiosus in arte librorum.

8 *Iustitiae custos rectus verusque fidelis,*
Pauperibus largus, miseris solacia praestans.

Ernst Dümmler, the editor of these verses, overlooks the fact that vv. 6 and 9 are from the epitaph of Pope Felix IV (Diehl, 986, 3, 5) and v. 8 is from that of Boniface III (Diehl, 992, 9-10):

Iustitiae custos, rectus patiensque benignus,
Cultus in eloquiis et pietate placens.

The same verses are inserted in an epitaph by Alcuin's pupil Hrabanus Maurus, *M. H. G., Poetae*, II, 237, 7-8:

*Iustitiae custos, rectus patiensque benignus,
Fidus in eloquiis et pietate placens.*

A future study of the epitaphs and the other metrical inscriptions collected in the four volumes of the *Poetae Latini Aevi Carolini* will not only reveal the survival of Roman and early Christian epigraphic elements in Carolingian epigraphy, but also bear out the assumption that a sylloge of model inscriptions²⁹ was often used by Carolingian writers. The use of such a literary manual for the composition of various types of inscriptions parallels that of professional handbooks³⁰ of Roman and medieval stone-cutters and engravers as an aid in the technical fabrication of lapidary and bronze inscriptions.

LUITPOLD WALLACH.

CORNELL UNIVERSITY.

²⁹ Karl Strecker, *M. G. H., Poetae*, IV, p. 1020, assumes for instance that Flodoard of Reims (saec. X) used such a sylloge of papal inscriptions; cf. also Scheffer-Boichorst, "Zur Kritik Flodoards von Rheims und päpstlicher Epitaphien," *M. I. O. E. G.*, VIII (1887), pp. 423-30; cf. A. Silvagni in *Diss. della Pontificia Accademia Rom. di Arch.*, II, 15 (1921), pp. 181-226; I have not seen A. Silvagni, *Monumenta epigraphica Christiana saeculo XIII antiquiora quae in Italiae finibus adhuc existant*, I (Rome, 1938); on new discoveries cf. the report by Attilio DeGrassi, "Epigrafia Romana," in *Doxa, Rassegna Critica di Antichità Classica*, II (1949), pp. 111-19: *Iscrizioni sepolcrali-cristiane*.

³⁰ Cf. Edmond Le Blant, "Sur les graveurs des inscriptions antiques," *Revue de l'Art Chrétien*, 1859; René Cagnat, "Sur les manuels professionnels des graveurs d'inscriptions Romaines," *Revue de Philologie*, XIII (1889), pp. 51-65. See also the discussion of the problem by Ewald Lissberger, *Das Fortleben der Römischen Elegiker in den Carmina Epigraphica* (Tübingen diss., 1934), pp. 9-13.

ARISTOTLE'S ANALYSIS OF THE NATURE OF POLITICAL STRUGGLE.

I. INTRODUCTORY.

This essay is a study of the notion of *οτάριος* in the light of Aristotle's treatment of the subject in the *Politics* and in the form of an examination of the analysis made by him of that notion. It seems hardly necessary to defend at length the view that this topic is one of considerable interest and importance. Two reasons for holding the view, however, are the following. First, our historical texts make it clear that *οτάριος* is a fundamental and persistent feature of Greek politics of the classical period. It follows, therefore, that we cannot expect to acquire an adequate grasp of the nature of Greek public life without first understanding the phenomenon which we call *οτάριος*. Second, it appears to be the case that the meaning of the word *οτάριος*, in so far as it can be at all precisely delimited, contains an element which is not adequately represented by any of the English equivalents which have been suggested. This is not so small a point as it might seem. The use of the word "revolution," as in Jowett's translation, for instance, and in most translations of Thucydides, is, I believe, thoroughly misleading. The connotation of *οτάριος* is distinctly narrower than that of social and economic disintegration which has been acquired in modern times by the word "revolution." If we say that "revolution" is a correct description of the events known collectively as the French Revolution and as the Russian Revolution, I do not think we can apply the term to the kind of events referred to by the Greeks as *οτάριος*, even though such events were frequently due, as Aristotle saw, to conflicts of an economic and social rather than of a purely political character.

It may be claimed, in conclusion, that, if translators have failed adequately to represent the meaning of the word, commentators have failed sufficiently to stress the importance of the notion of *οτάριος* as discussed by Aristotle. The majority¹ confine

¹ E.g. F. Susemihl and R. D. Hicks, *The Politics of Aristotle* (London, 1894), pp. 56-66. E. Zeller, *Aristotle and the Earlier*